Non-Academic Program Review at a Community College: Methods and Practices

by
Piotr Kocik, Director
Dereck Norville, Senior Research Analyst

Office of Institutional Research and Student Assessment
Hostos Community College

April 30th, 2015
Learning Objectives

• By the end of this session, participants will be able to …

  – Explain what Non-Academic Program Review is and its benefits
  – Differentiate Non-Academic Program Review from Academic Program Review
  – Identify a process for implementing and conducting Non-Academic Program Review
  – Determine the role that offices of institutional research can take in supporting non-APR processes.
But First... a Joke!

An engineer, a chemist, and a statistician are working in a lab when a fire breaks out in a wastebasket. The engineer says: “We need some water to put out the fire!”, while the chemist says: “We don’t need water, we just need to cover the waste basket and prevent oxygen from getting to the fire, and it will go out.”

A heated argument between the engineer and chemist ensues over the better method of putting out the fire. Meanwhile, the statistician, having listened intently to the other two, begins running around the lab setting more fires. On realizing this, the engineer and chemist say to the statistician, “Wait! what are you doing?!! You will burn the whole building down!!!”.

The statistician replies, “Look folks, if you really want to know which method works better, you are going to need a larger sample size.”
INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

PART I
Institutional Effectiveness at Hostos Community College

• Institutional Effectiveness is typically assessed by conducting Academic Program Review (APR)

• Hostos Community College has an established record of assessing the efficacy of its academic programs through APR.
Ensuring Institutional Effectiveness

• Ensuring institutional effectiveness and academic excellence necessitates an understanding of what takes place in the classroom and beyond.

1. Assessing the efficacy of a college’s academic programs is one process used to enhance learning and student success.

2. Assessing the efficacy of a college’s non-academic programs is the other.
The Missing Piece(s)

College Divisions at Hostos Community College

- Administration and Finance
- Academic Affairs
- Institutional Advancement
- Continuing Education and Workforce Development
- Student Development and Enrollment Management

College Divisions at Hostos Community College that Underwent Review in the Past

- Administration and Finance
- Academic Affairs
- Institutional Advancement
- Continuing Education and Workforce Development
- Student Development and Enrollment Management
Structure of Assessment at Hostos

- **Institutional Level**
  - General Education
  - Operational Planning
  - PMP

- **Program Level**
  - SLO Program Assessment
  - Academic Program Review (APR)
  - Non-Academic Program Review (Non-APRs)

- **Course Level**
  - SLO Course Assessment
NON-ACADEMIC PROGRAM REVIEW (NON-APR)

PART II
Differences btwn APR and Non-APR

**Academic Program Review (APR)**
- A study of program effectiveness that goes beyond the assessment of student learning to examine:
  - administrative effectiveness,
  - relevance of course offerings to industry standards,
  - instructional and student support services, and
  - adequacy of faculty and staff.

**Non-Academic Program Review (Non-APR)**
- A study of individual offices, programs, or initiatives that are not specifically academic in nature to assess:
  - operational effectiveness and efficiency;
  - direct or indirect impact on student success; and
  - adequacy of staff and resources.
Non-APR in a Nutshell

Phases of Non-APR Process

- Self-Study Phase
- External Review Phase
- Implementation Phase
## Sample Calendar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CEWD</td>
<td>CUNY Language Immersion Program</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY Start</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Work Incentive Planning &amp; Assistance</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Program (WIPA)</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Allied Healthcare Certificate Programs</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Allied Health Career Pipeline</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY CareerPATH</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ESL Programs</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional Development &amp; Certificate</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Programs and Classes</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nonprofit Management Certificate</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jobs-Plus</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Career Services</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Personal Enrichment and Children's</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Liberty Partnership</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High Equivalency Programs</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATTAIN Lab</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Self-Study Phase

• The self-study phase of Non-APR commences once the divisional VPs formally charge the directors of the programs/offices (slated to undergo review) to begin the process. This phase allows programs and offices to examine their own internal operations and outcomes. This self-reflective process culminates in a report that covers several components:
  – Program/Office Overview
  – Program/Office, Mission, Goals, and Objectives
  – Changes/Improvements Since Last Review (if applicable)
  – External Partnerships and Collaborations
  – Outcomes Assessment
  – Customer Analysis
  – Personnel, Facilities, and Resources
  – SWOT Analysis
  – Future Directions and Recommendations
External Review Phase

• External reviews provide a review of each program/office from a different perspective and allow for a well-rounded and comprehensive review
  – Each program/office director identifies 2 or 3 potential reviewers (who are external to the college); the divisional VPs make the final selection of an external reviewer
  – An external reviewer(s) is invited to review the self-study report and related documents and materials
  – Conduct a site visit and prepares a report that may include recommendations
Implementation Phase

• The implementation phase is the program/office’s opportunity to identify recommendations from the self-study and from the external review and implement appropriate and feasible changes to improve program/office outcomes.

• Implementation of recommendations can depend on:
  – **Time:** short-term versus long-term
  – **Oversight:**
    • can be implemented by the program independently
    • requires collaboration between offices, programs, or divisions
    • requires the intervention and/or assistance of a higher authority (e.g., Provost, President)
  – **Budgetary Requirements:**
    • funding sources may be needed to implement the recommendation

• Implementation of Non-APR recommendations are made by the office or program in consultation with the division V.P.
Benefits of the Non-APR Process

- Potential to improve program/office efficiency
- Ability to continuously and systematically assess outcomes
- Ability to demonstrate program benefits to current/potential funding sources and to the community
- Potential to strengthen accountability and provide a sense of ownership around assessment
- Ability to align program/office goals/anticipated outcomes with the college mission, through improved transparency

Enhanced Operations, Improved Student Outcomes, & Institutional Effectiveness
INVESTMENTS IN THE NON-APR PROCESS

PART III
Investments in *Developing* the Non-APR Process

- Although the development of the non-APR process was spearheaded by the Office of Institutional Research and Student Assessment (OIRSA) at Hostos, successfully establishing the new process required several investments including:
  - Working collaboratively with divisional and college leadership;
  - Incorporating Non-APR into the college’s new Institutional Assessment Plan; and
  - Garnering buy-in from important stakeholders.
Investments in Implementing the Non-APR Process

• The successful implementation of the Non-APR process required:
  – The development of resource materials and guides to aid directors;
  – The development of training workshops; and
  – The establishment of divisional liaisons to work closely with OIRSA
NON-APR AT HOSTOS: A LOOK INSIDE

PART IV
First Two Years

• In AY2013-2014 all units undergoing Non-APR were in the “self-study phase”; this year those units are all undergoing the next phase and other units have begun the process.

• The calendar of programs/offices to be reviewed was set before the rolling out of the process, in collaboration with the VPs of each division.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Division</th>
<th>Program(s)/Unit(s)</th>
<th>Self-Study</th>
<th>External Review</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AY2013-2014</td>
<td>ADM</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEWD</td>
<td>CUNY Language Immersion Program (CLIP)</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY Start</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Work Incentive Planning &amp; Assistance Program (WIPA)</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IAD</td>
<td>Alumni Relations Office</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SDEM</td>
<td>Athletics &amp; Recreation</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Children’s Center</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Student Success Coaches Unit</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Registrar’s Office</td>
<td>Postponed</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AY2014-2015</td>
<td>ADM</td>
<td>Bursar's Office</td>
<td>Delayed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Business Office</td>
<td>Delayed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEWD</td>
<td>Allied Healthcare Certificate Programs (BX)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Allied Healthcare Certificate Programs (CITH)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Allied Health Career Pipeline Program (HPOG)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY CareerPATH</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jobs-Plus</td>
<td>Postponed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IAD</td>
<td>Office of Communications</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SDEM</td>
<td>Counseling Services</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wellness Services (Health)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Registrar’s Office</td>
<td>Not Started</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer Services</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Non-Academic Program Reviews Undergone since AY2013-2014

―

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Division</th>
<th>Program(s)/Unit(s)</th>
<th>Self-Study</th>
<th>External Review</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AY2013-2014</td>
<td>ADM</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEWD</td>
<td>CUNY Language Immersion Program (CLIP)</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY Start</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Work Incentive Planning &amp; Assistance Program (WIPA)</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IAD</td>
<td>Alumni Relations Office</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SDEM</td>
<td>Athletics &amp; Recreation</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Children’s Center</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Student Success Coaches Unit</td>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Registrar’s Office</td>
<td>Postponed</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AY2014-2015</td>
<td>ADM</td>
<td>Bursar's Office</td>
<td>Delayed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Business Office</td>
<td>Delayed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CEWD</td>
<td>Allied Healthcare Certificate Programs (BX)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Allied Healthcare Certificate Programs (CITH)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The Allied Health Career Pipeline Program (HPOG)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CUNY CareerPATH</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jobs-Plus</td>
<td>Postponed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IAD</td>
<td>Office of Communications</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SDEM</td>
<td>Counseling Services</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wellness Services (Health)</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Registrar’s Office</td>
<td>Not Started</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer Services</td>
<td>In Progress</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Non-Academic Program Reviews Undergone since AY2013-2014
OIRSA’s Role at the Beginning of the Self-Study Phase

• OIRSA provides a training workshop at the beginning of the academic year to orient directors slated to have their programs/units undergo review in the upcoming year.

• Topics covered include:
  – Description, purpose, and benefits of Non-APR
  – Continuous improvement through Non-APR
  – Phases of the Non-APR process
  – Components of each phase of Non-APR
  – Considerations for each phase
  – Process management
  – Identifying data needs for the self-study report
OIRSA’s Role *During* the Self-Study Phase

- During the self-study process, OIRSA provides support in several ways:
  - Consultations (regularly scheduled meetings or as needed)
  - Technical support
  - Data analysis
  - Process Management
OIRSA’s Role toward the *End* of the Self-Study Phase

• One of OIRSA’s primary responsibilities in the self-study process is quality assurance.

• OIRSA ensures that self-study report drafts are clear, coherent, and comprehensive by reviewing (and in some cases revising) drafts and providing feedback and suggestions.
OIRSA’s Role in the External Review Phase

• There are 3 primary components of the External Review phase:
  1. Reviewer Selection
  2. Campus visit and review of Self-study report
  3. Preparation of reviewer’s report
OIRSA’s Role in the External Review Phase (con’t)

• OIRSA supports these components in various ways:
  – Providing guidelines, timelines, and deadlines to help guide the process
  – Consulting with program/unit directors to map out the steps in the process and troubleshoot challenges
  – Ensuring that the reviewer’s final report is used in the third phase …
OIRSA’s Role in the Implementation Phase

• OIRSA’s primary role in this phase is to work with divisional leadership and program/unit directors to:

  – Assess the feasibility of proposed recommendations from the 2 prior phases.
  – Ensure that any implemented recommendations have a solid plan for assessing their efficacy (via the development of instruments, metrics, rubrics, etc.)
SUCCESSES, CHALLENGES, & LESSONS LEARNED TO-DATE

PART V
Successes of Non-APR Process

• The master calendar of Non-APR assessment activities has been mostly on track.
• Garnering buy-in to the Non-APR process, among program/office directors, was relatively seamless.
• OIRSA’s organizational structure with divisional liaisons allowed for adequate and tailored support to programs/offices within divisions.
• Several program/office directors acknowledged the value of the process itself.
Challenges with Non-APR Process

• Some program/unit directors felt slightly overwhelmed by the new process.
• Understanding what data needed to be included to demonstrate outcomes or having a lack of data.
• Some programs/offices demonstrated an unwillingness to work collaboratively with or receive support from OIRSA.
Future Directions for the Non-APR Process

• Assessments via survey and/or focus group(s) to gauge satisfaction with the Non-APR process and possible areas of improvement.

• Readjust the college-wide Institutional Assessment Plan to reflect changes in office structure

• Develop concrete work plans to make the self-study process more manageable and to encourage stakeholder engagement.
QUESTIONS?