****

**College-Wide Senate General Meeting**

**Savoy Multi-Purpose Room**

**Thursday, March 15, 2018**

**Senate Meeting Minutes**

**Present:**

* **Allied Health:** Professors Edward King, Manny Livingston, Sandra Castellanos
* **Behavioral and Social Sciences:** Professors Ernest Ialongo (Chairperson), Héctor Soto, Karen Steinmayer
* **Business:** Professors Claude Fernandez, Sandy Figueroa
* **CTL**: James Lujan
* **Education:** Professors Jacqueline DiSanto, Elys Vazquez-Iscan, Iris Mercado
* **English:** Professors Heidi Bollinger, Tram Nguyen, Louis Bury
* **Humanities:** Professors Isaac Goldemberg, Ana Ozuna, Inmaculada Lara Bonilla
* **Language & Cognition:** Professors Thomas Mencher, Paula Korsko
* **Library:** Professor Jorge Matos
* **Mathematics:** Professors Lauren Wolf, Alexander Vaninsky
* **Natural Sciences:** Professor John Gillen, Roy Debasish
* **HEOs:** Safiya Faustin, Carlos Guevara, Yvette Luyando, Alba Lynch, Cynthia Morales-Delbrun, Daliz Perez-Cabezas, Fabian Wander, Elizabeth Wilson, Iber Poma
* **UFS:** Professors Felipe Pimentel, Zvi Ostrin, Julie Trachman
* **UFS Alternates:** Professors Gail August
* **At Large:** Professors William Casari, James Kennis, Kate Wolfe, Sherese Mitchell, Diana Macri, Nancy Genova, Thomas Beachdel, Mathew Moses
* **Adjunct Rep:** Professor Ruben Worrell
* **SGA:** Thierno Diallo (President), Mauricette Gbenenoui**,** Ines P. Alejandro Soriano, Celestina Cayetano, Adama Savadogo, Oumar Diaby, Olawunmi Ajibola, Justin Arzola, Fatoumata Diallo, Denise Herrera, Destini Mitchell-Murray, Stephane Duviella, Mushira Nasser, Krysti Stern-Rodriguez, Raziel BenReuben, Abdoul Balde

**Absent** *(excused)***:**

* **Education:** Professor Michael Gosset
* **Mathematics:** Professor A.J. Stachelek
* **HEOs:** Ms. Moscat Mercedes
* **Public Safety / Maintenance:** P.O. Johanna Powell
* **University Faculty Senate –** **Alternates:** Professor Catherine Lewis
* **At Large:** Professors Andrew Connolly,
* **Humanities:** Professor Natasha Yannacañedo
* **HEOs:** Deputy Registrar Terrence Brown

**Absent:**

* **Gittleson:** Ms. Tanya Navarro
* **Professional Staff Congress:** Professor Lizette Colon
* **At Large**: Professor Clara Nieto-Wire

**Vacant:**

* **Counseling (1)**
* **HEO (1)**
* **Adjunct Representative (1)**

**Visitors:**

Mr. Shmuel Gerber (Parliamentarian), Mr. Kevin DeVone (SGA Ambassador),

Ms. LaToya Dubety (CD Counselor), Professor Francisco Fernandez (Chair Natural Sciences Department), Assistant Professor Anna Manukyan (Natural Sciences), Mr. Eric Rodriguez (CD Counselor), Associate Dean Anna Mester (OAA), Executive Council Eugene Sohn (Legal Office), Graciano Matos (Success Coach).

***1. Call to Order***

* Senate came to order at 3:33 PM.

***2. Approval of the Agenda***

* March Agenda approved by acclimation.

***3. Approval of Thursday, February 15th College-Wide Senate Minutes***

* **Correction:** At the request of a Senator, adjustment made regarding Senator’s

omission from the record ofattendance of the February Senate meeting.

* Upon motion duly made, the Minutes of the February 15, 2018 College-Wide Senate Meeting were approved as stated.

***4. Chair’s Remarks***

* As concerns new Senators, Vacancies and Elections:
  + Acknowledged and welcomed Professor Thomas Mencher of the *Language and Cognition Department* as a new Senator who received a congratulatory round of applause from the Senate body.
  + Elections Committee Chair James Kennis, as soon as the Office of Legal Counsel provides the lists of certified votes, will be contacting you regarding nominations and subsequent elections for:
    - UFS full and part-time elections.
    - Pathways Committees.
  + Four Departments will be electing Chairs this semester, namely, Natural Sciences, Business, English and Language & Cognition. As such, each Department will be electing its candidates to run as At-Large members for the College-Wide Personnel and Budget Committee.
    - These P&B elections will be conducted during the second week of May so be prepared accordingly.
    - Each Department will have one candidate on the ballot.
* As concerns the Senate Committees:
  + The Chair and Vice Chair Tram Nguyen to date have met with the following Committees:
    - Elections
    - Grants
    - Scholarships & Awards
    - Facilities
    - Affirmative Action
    - Budget and Finance
      * In response to a question posed by a Senator regarding the B&F Committee operation, the Chair explained the relevant rules and protocols.
  + Each Committee has its charge confirmed and each was provided with:
    - Guidelines concerning procedures for Meetings.
    - A template for Committee Meeting minutes.
  + Each Committee was also provided with information concerning what is,

as well as whatwill be available on the Senate website (inclusive of CWCC information).

* + Any remaining Committee will be visited as soon as reasonably possible.

* As concerns the approved Charter Amendments:
  + No further information to report concerning pending Charter amendments other than follow-up continues.
* As concerns Curricular Items Procedures:
  + Chair, CWCC Chair Professor Sandy Figueroa and Deputy Registrar Terrence Brown had meeting with Assistant Dean Felix Cardona to start discussion concerning how best to strengthen and streamline the processes involved so as to achieve a more efficient and effective transition of curricular items from the Senate to OAA and to the CUNY Board of Trustees.
* As concerns Smart Room Conversions:
  + Followed-up with IT and Director of Buildings and was informed regarding the following:
    - Five (5) conversions scheduled for the third floor of the “B” Building

are expected to be completed by Spring 2020.

* + - Three (3) conversions in the “A” are expected to be completed during the next 12 months.
    - As always, availability of funding is the continuing issue.
* As concerns Clickers:
  + Consulted with AVP Varun Sehgal, who needs in the first instance to further explore availability of campus resources to meet the Senate’s needs.
  + If some other technology, or clickers, is found to meet the Senate’s needs, then its implementation will be fast tracked.

***5. President’s Remarks***

* + As concerns the Hostos College Budget:
    - The fiscal situation facing the college remains serious as the budget

is still pending, but the announced reduction is the reality.

* + - The focus of the college is getting through the current year.
    - Will continue to update and share information with the Senate.
  + As concerns CUNY’s search for a new Chancellor:
    - The President prioritizes his focus on the CUNY Chancellor Search Committee as follows: Hostos firstly, the community colleges secondly, and CUNY thirdly. As such, he especially would like input from the Hostos community regarding issues of importance to this institution. He expects to meet soon with the College-Wide Senate Executive Committee and the SGA.
    - He will continue to the extent possible to meet with members of the college community through the end of the search process to both update and seek input.
  + President offered his best wishes to the members of the Senate regarding the upcoming Spring Recess.

***6. SGA President’s Remarks:***

* + As concerns the March graduation:
    - President expressed SGA’s concerns regarding the March 2nd Graduation.
      * Participation was generally very low.
      * The low participation was due to a failure during planning to have adequate input from the SGA and the involved students.
      * Also low as a result of information and notices concerning the event not being sent in a timely manner to the involved students.
  + As concerns the CUNY Student Activity Fee (SAF):
    - The SGA on March 14, 2018 passed an Endorsement Resolution in support of University Student Senate (USS) Resolution 1718-P2, which calls on the CUNY Board of Trustees to preserve the CUNY students’ rights to self-governance of the Student Activity Fee.
    - The USS and Hostos SGA Resolutions were prompted by CUNY Board of Trustees proposed amendments to the CUNY Bylaws and CUNY Fiscal Accountability Handbook that would cause a restructuring of the SAF that would infringe on the student’s right to self-governance especially as concerns selection of allowable categories of SAF expenditures and organizations for SAF funding.
    - The SGA Resolution calls on Hostos President D. Gomez to issue a statement requesting that the CUNY Board of Trustees preserve CUNY students’ rights to self-govern their fees.
    - The SGA will conduct a Town Hall Meeting on Thursday, March 29th to inform and advise students regarding this issue.
      * The SGA President answered question regarding the SAF issue especially in connection with SFA funding of organizations generally, and the organization NYPIRG in particular.

***7. Curricular Items***

***Professor Sandy Figueroa, Chair of the College-Wide Curriculum***

***Committee, coordinated the Curricular Items presentations***

* **Action 1**.
  + Natural Sciences ENV 110 & 120: Revisions to the Course Descriptions and Content.
    - Professor Damaris-Lois Lang presented the explanation and rationale for the proposed changes.
  + Debate ensued.
    - Questions raised concerning language in original ENV110 description regarding the offering of the course in English and Spanish, but no similar language in the revised ENV110 description.
    - Motion duly made to amend the revised ENV 110 description to add wording at end of the revised description that matches the language in the original ENV 110 description, to wit: To be offered in English and Spanish.
      * Debate ensued.
      * Motion duly made and passed to call the question.
      * Motion to amend the ENV 110 description as proposed approved.
  + Chairman Ialongo made a motion to end debate on the ENV 110 & ENV 120 revisions as amended. The motion was accepted by unanimous consent.
  + Results of **Action 1**: **Item passed**.
    - Yes: 54, No: 1, Abstain: 0, Invalid: 0.
* **Action 2**.
  + Pathways designation and submittal for Natural Sciences ENV 110 & ENV 120 as amended as follows: ENV 110 - Life & Physical Sciences

ENV 120 -Scientific World

* + - Debate ensued including questions concerning the Pathway’s process and the Course Submission Form
  + Chairman Ialongo made a motion to end debate on Pathways designation and submittal regarding the ENV 110 & ENV 120 as amended;
  + Motion was accepted by acclimation and question was called.
  + Results of **Action 2**: **Item passed**.
    - Yes: 57, No: 3, Abstain: 1, Invalid: 0.

**8**. ***Non-Curricular Voting Items***

* + None

**9. *Reports of the Senate Standing Committees***

* + There were no Committee Reports.

***10. University Faculty Senate (UFS) Report***

**UFS Report**for March 13, 2018 Plenary Session

We had several guests and a few reports (so I am being selective below in what I am reporting).  Also note some of the information being provided below regarding the SAF issue, etc. will help us understand better the Hostos SGA resolution being provided to us today as well as understand why the emphasis on this issue at their upcoming SGA town hall to be held on March 29, 2018.

1)SVC/CFO Matt Sapienza made a few comments regarding the location of the Enrollment Management area being locating in CUNY’s Finance Office.  He mentioned the new addition to his area of Ms. L. Bruno and Mr. M. Cioli.  Mr. Cioli spoke for a few minutes regarding enrollment levels at the undergraduate level and about recruitment efforts in the NYC area, etc.  Application levels are up; however, CUNY enrollment levels recently peaked and now is in a decline (some of this is due to our increased graduation rates as had been mentioned previously).  Then Ms. Sonja Prophete spoke at length in regard to graduate school enrollment, etc.

2)UFS Executive Committee Members, Profs. H. Fernandez and E. Tai provided us with an update on the student activity fee (SAF) proposal and the Fiscal Accountability Handbook.  Some of what was said can also be found in the UFS blog entry co-authored by Profs. Fernandez and Tai (in a number of places using their language).  The URL for the blog entry “Taking the Measure of Student Fees” is: <http://www1.cuny.edu/sites/cunyufs/2018/02/16/taking-the-measure-of-student-fees/> .

There is a working group assisting a task force working on potentially changing the language in CUNY’s By-laws, Articles 15 and 16 as well as CUNY’s Fiscal Accountability Handbook.  They are trying to make these changes in order to be in compliance with prevailing law and best practices.  These issues have been brought to the forefront because of a pending lawsuit involving a student group at Queens College, who felt they had been denied support as a student club based on ideological criteria. They are being assisted by a national organization of religious rights attorneys.

One issue emanating from this is viewpoint neutrality and is predicated on the decision of the 2002 Supreme Court case, Southworth and Thompson vs. Board of Reagents of the Univ. of Wisc. System.  Essentially colleges and university should not allow student referenda to determine how SAF money would be allocated.  The concern is that a “popular” organization could secure more monetary support over a less popular organization.  All organizations should enjoy equal monetary support.

The Task Force has been looking at how SAF at various campuses are utilized and this varies considerably.  SAF moneys may even be used to support campus childcare centers, food pantries, etc.\* Several campuses use SAF money to support NY Public Interest Research Group (NYPIRG) campus branches and this use of SAF money is also contentious.  It is being questioned whether SAF moneys should be used to support outside agencies and it is not clear whether these student-driven NYPIRG branches should be considered to be “outside” agencies.  Some of this concern is in response to the 2007 NYS court case, Amidon vs. Student Assn. of SUNY, which challenged campus use of money to support NYPIRG.

\* Prof. G. August added that typically ~20% of SAF is used to support clubs and the remaining amounts are used to provide moneys to help run campus facilities such as childcare centers that provide important services to our CUNY students.

3)CUNY General Counsel L. Martinez provided us with a draft proposal on these matters.  Some aspects of the proposal are:

a)changes in the language of Articles 15 & 16 of the By-laws and the Fiscal Accountability Handbook.

b)eliminate use of referenda to earmark money to different organizations and use referenda only to determine the amounts of the SAFs at the various campuses

c)change the manner in the way referenda would get on college-wide ballots

d)discontinue the practice of allowing SAFs to be used directly to support outside agencies such as NYPIRG.

It was not clearly stated in the draft but it was mentioned at several points in the evening that SAF oversight would shift from students to a body that would be driven by college administration with some student input.

Obviously a lot of the above is contentious.  The Queens College student leader of its NYPIRG branch spoke to us for a few minutes regarding why NYPIRG should continue receiving SAF support.  According to her, the campus branch is totally student run.

N.B. At the Student Affairs Committee meeting, the UFS Parliamentarian, Prof. K. Coughlin, provided us with an analysis of some of the relevant case law.

4)Prof. G. Kay, President of the SUNY Faculty Senate and Prof. N. Tamrowsky, Pres. Of the SUNY Faculty Council of Community Colleges both spoke to us for a few minutes about various issues at their campuses, with many also of concern to us.

5)There were brief committee reports made as well as a report from UFS chair, Prof. K. Conway.

6)Lastly, information on this flyer for the March for our Lives in NYC to be held on March 24, 2018 may be of interest to some of you.

***11. Old Business***

* + None

***12. New Business***

* Item 1.
  + Senator raised issues regarding assessments being required OAA. Questions concerning:
    - Expectations & lack of written guidelines
    - Metrics
    - Data analysis
    - Privacy
    - Results
  + Discussion ensued regarding the questions presented.
  + As the answer to the questions posed could best be answered by the Provost, Chair Ialongo asked if the Senate would entertain a motion to invite the Provost to the next Senate meeting to address the issue and questions raised.
  + Upon motion duly made and passed, the Chair will extend an invitation to the Provost to attend the next Senate meeting (April 19, 2018) to address the issue and questions raised.
  + For future reference purposes, Chair Ialongo explained what could be addressed under the heading of New Business as per the Senate’s procedures and protocols.

There were no additional New Business items.

***13. Adjournment***

* Upon duly made motion, the Senate Meeting was adjourned at 4:45 PM

***Prepared by Professor Hector W. Soto, Public Policy and Law Unit, Behavioral and Social Sciences Department / Senate Recording Secretary***